

## Key stage 2

### Pupil A – Piece A: a balanced argument

Context: drawing on 'Jemmy Button' by Jennifer Uma, and their work on evolution, pupils explored features of discussion texts before writing their own balanced argument addressing the question: 'Was it right for the visitors to take Jemmy Button to England?'

In 1830, a 13 year old boy was taken hostage from his home island. The boy's name was Orundellico and he lived on the island of Tierra del fuego. A man named Captain Robert Fitzroy had been watching the people on the island for a long time and wanted to attempt an experiment. He traded ~~Orun~~ Orundellico for a mother of pearl button, gave him the name 'Jemmy Button' and they set sail on the HMS Beagle. Robert's experiment was going to take place as soon as they arrived in England; the captain was going to change Jemmy Button into a proper English gentleman.

Although the trip sounded like a great idea, there were many negatives for Jemmy. Firstly, he would be leaving his family and probably would not see them for a very long time. Another point is that Captain Fitzroy did not speak the same language as Jemmy Button so he did not understand a word the captain was saying. Jemmy had no clothes for the long journey ahead or any for when they reached their destination. In addition, he may have felt out of place in this bustling country or felt homesick. As well as this, it was unfair for Jemmy's family: they had no understanding of where he was going or if they could even trust Captain Robert Fitzroy. They will not know if their son will be cared for properly. Also, they would not be able to communicate to Orundellico.

However, not everybody believed that the uprooting of Jemmy Button was a negative visit. Some English people were excited to be sharing their home country with a 'wild man' and others' opinions were that he was in a better

place and belonged there. Despite Jemmy's savage ways, he was treated very well and became unbelievably popular; he even met Queen Adelaide and King William IV. The scientists were very pleased with their results: Jemmy Button was transformed into an English gentleman. As well as Jemmy learning about upper class ~~the~~ manners, Englishmen were very interested in the cultures of Tierra del fuego and learnt many more interesting facts.

In conclusion, it seems that there are more powerful arguments against Jemmy's abduction than for. He missed his home and family, was placed in a bustling country of strangers and did not wish to be in England for as long as he was. Luckily, Jemmy was very willing to relearn his native language and ways. Do you think it was to take Jemmy Button to England?